

Interactive comment on “Quasi-hydrostatic equations for climate models and the study on linear instability” by Robert Nigmatulin and Xiulin Xu

Ilias Sibgatullin

sibgat@imec.msu.ru

Received and published: 9 October 2020

Dear Robert Nigmatulin and Xiulin Xu,

C1

- 1 “For the vertical momentum equation, the buoyancy term $-b'$ is included in (13). In our set of equations, the vertical inertial is totally ignored in the vertical momentum equation, the sixth equation of (2.23).”**

Is there any connection between “vertical inertial is totally ignored” and ignoring of buoyancy term $-b'$? Do you want to tell that you have ignored buoyancy perturbations in your hydrostatic approximation model, and vertical gradient of pressure deviation is no more balanced? In such a case vertical hydrostatic balance would be violated and its not very clear what you are studying. Or may be you have misinterpreted your own writings?

- 2 “ To close the system of equations, we use a new independent variable $\dot{M}$ and the equation corresponding to this variable, the fifth equation of (2.23).”**

Let's look at your “independent” variables:

$$(\rho, v_x, v_y, v_z, \dot{M}, M),$$

where

$$M = \int_z \rho dz \quad (1)$$

$$\dot{M} = - \int_z \text{div}_{\text{hor}}(\rho v_{\text{hor}}) dz \quad (2)$$

(such a notation is strange for me since $\dot{M} \neq \frac{dM}{dt}$, especially in the walls of the faculty of mechanics and mathematics, but you can do it).

C2

I thought before that you made such a trick to make the system evolutionary, since from above it follows f.e.

$$\frac{\partial M}{\partial t} = \dot{M} + \rho v_z \quad (3)$$

But now I've looked in the appendix A for the matrix B_t and it looks like you did not even used the expression above for $\frac{\partial M}{\partial t}$! Instead, you put in your matrices the expression $\frac{\partial M}{\partial z} = -\rho$.

Only three equation in your six-equations system for perturbations are evolutionary, i.e. they have $\frac{\partial}{\partial t}$. And still you give the 6×6 matrix for linear analysis, as if it was for 6×6 evolutionary system. It's an amazing approach, but I am lost now what is the connection of such an approach to the analysis of perturbations of the hydrostatic approximation.

Interactive comment on Geosci. Model Dev. Discuss., <https://doi.org/10.5194/gmd-2020-146>, 2020.